Research Article

Maintaining Monarchy in Amidst Disruptive Era: Case Study Kasultanan Ngayogyakarta, Indonesia

Sidik Jatmika¹
Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta
sidikjatmika@umy.ac.id

Ajeng Puspa Marlinda²
Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta
ajengmarlinda@gmail.com

Abstract

Monarchy is an interesting political system to study because it is the earliest political system in world history and still exists today with various variations. This article focuses on the Yogyakarta Sultanate which was founded in 1755 as the only monarchy that still exists administratively in the political system of the Republic of Indonesia. This qualitative study finds that Yogyakarta’s political system fulfills holistic, adaptive elements and combines old and new elements so that Yogyakarta gets asymmetric decentralization status from the republican central government of Indonesia. However, Yogyakarta has problems in the succession system because it does not yet have written and open rules like the British, Dutch, and Spanish monarchies. This study recommends the importance of a special study of the monarchy with all its survival capabilities in a modern democratic system.

Keywords: uniqueness, semi-monarchy, asymmetric decentralization, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

I. Introduction

National integration, especially with regard to the relationship between local political actors and the central government, is one of the central issues in the study of International Relations. This, among others, is reflected in various peaceful cases, political tensions and open conflicts. Open conflict, occurred in the case of Rakhine state with Myanmar (Kipgen, 2013); Trigray with Ethiopia (Gavin, 2021). Political tensions combined between negotiations and open conflict; happening in Pattani with the Thai Central Government (Ockey, 2021), Papua with the Government of Indonesia (Viartasiwi, 2018). Tensions in regional relations with the center, occurred in Hong Kong and China (Novelin, 2020); Catalonia with Spanish (Mukti et al., 2019). Conflict resolution after peace talks, the Northern Irish Catholic group took place with the British Central Government in London (Guelke, 2014); Aceh with the central government of the Republic of Indonesia through the 2006 Helsinki agreement; on Bangsamoro with the Philippine Government; on Bangsamoro with the Philippine Government (Jatmika et al., 2022).

This study focuses on the case of the Uniqueness of Yogyakarta Special Province in the form of a semi-monarchy in the practice of Asymmetric Decentralization in The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. This is important to study because the actual process of enacting privileges law number 13/2012 concerning the Privileges of Yogyakarta occurred after going through various tensions. For example, the formation of the Ijab Qobul Brigade; referendum discourse; preparation of ID cards and even passports if one day Yogyakarta breaks away from Indonesia. In 2022, privileges law number 13/2012 have entered 10 years and are marked by the stipulation of Sri Sultan HB X and Pakualaman IX as Governor and Deputy Governor of Special Region of Yogyakarta (Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta, DIY).

¹ ² International Relations Department, Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta
The emergence of the privilege of Yogyakarta is a gift from a very long struggle process. The Sultanate of Yogyakarta is part of the Mataram Kingdom which is divided into two parts, namely the Sultanate of Yogyakarta and the Kasunanan of Surakarta. The entry of the Dutch into the Sultanate of Yogyakarta made Sri Sultan have no power in the government because it was managed by Pepatih Dalem. After the Proclamation of Independence of the Republic of Indonesia, Yogyakarta joined the Republic of Indonesia and from here Sri Sultan played a very important role in national politics. Because the leaders of Yogyakarta issued mandates and edicts, the government issued Law no. 22 of 1948 which stipulates Yogyakarta as a level II region and is updated with Law No. 3 of 1950 which stipulates the Establishment of the Special Region of Yogyakarta. Then came Law no. 1 of 1957 and Law no. 6 of 1959 which contains about regional government, and the last is the issuance of Law no. 18 of 1965 which recognizes that Yogyakarta is one of the special regions and at the same level as the province. The specialty of Yogyakarta is seen from the city of struggle in the field of education, the capital of struggle, harmony between leaders, and being a source of wisdom for its people. In addition, Yogyakarta is an area that has a noble culture and is a cultural heritage from ancient times that still exists today (Felinda, 2011). After Indonesia's independence, Yogyakarta was given a Status Charter by President Soekarno, which is a concrete (de facto) recognition of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat Sultanate and is de jure fully recognized for its existence based on the constitution and laws and regulations within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia as a special region at the provincial and regional levels. emphasized its through privileges law number 13/2012. The implication of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat Sultanate for the privileges of DIY is the granting of several special powers, namely filling the position of Governor, Regional Institutions, Culture, Land and Spatial Planning. Specifically in the form of DIY Asymmetric Pilihan Kepala Daerah (PILKADA), and DIY Regional Governance. The concept of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat Sultanate in the constitutional structure of the Republic of Indonesia, first, the leadership that encourages the privilege of DIY through strengthening the paugeran values of the Sultanate which can support the mixed government concept of monarchy, democracy and transcendence within the scope of the Republic of Indonesia. Second, the creation of a balanced central-regional relationship, on the one hand the Government of Indonesia has accommodated the wishes of the DIY community through privileges law number 13/2012, on the other hand the Sultanate is required to make improvements and adjustments to regulations as ordered by privileges law number 13/2012 (Triwahyuningsih et al., 2020).

In recent years, Yogyakarta has faced a problematic situation, which is probably caused by the development of various modern trading facilities and star-rated hotels throughout the city. On the one hand, these activities have stimulated the economy, on the other hand they are considered activities that reduce the comfort of people's lives. The comfortable atmosphere as a product of traditional urban layout that characterizes the city seems to be disappearing. On the other hand, the effectiveness of the implementation of privileges law number 13/2012 concerning the Distinction of the Special Region of Yogyakarta in the Field of City Spatial Planning has become questionable. One of the reasons is because the substance of the regulation is weak, due to the limited understanding of the peculiarities of Yogyakarta City Spatial Planning. To limit these problems, the
prominent urban spatial planning as mentioned above is placed in a historical and cultural frame, in line with the main considerations of privileges law number 13/2012. The extraordinary value of the city of Yogyakarta includes three components, namely signs (components of urban spatial planning); signage (configuration of space utilization and structure) and the concept of signage (embedded meaning). The extraordinary value of Yogyakarta City Spatial Planning is characterized by two main concepts, namely the philosophical ax of Tugu-Kraton-Panggung Krapyak and the Mandala structure of the Pathok Negoro Mosque. Overall, the extraordinary value of Yogyakarta City Spatial Planning is Prince Mangkubumi's masterpiece in the field of urban spatial development (Suryanto, Achmad Djunaedi, Sudaryono, 2015).

As a country whose economic system is still dependent on public sector financing, the hope that the decentralization policy in Indonesia can significantly improve the people's welfare has not been fulfilled. This is like what happened in the Special Region of Yogyakarta which has special authority in regulating its government affairs. Privileges law number 13/2012 concerning the Privileges of DIY covers 5 matters (Mutiarin & Sakir, 2015; Purnawan, 2016), namely (1) How to Fill in the Position, Position, Duties and Authorities of the Governor and Deputy Governor; (2) Institutional Affairs; (3) Cultural Affairs; (4) Land Affairs; and (5) Spatial Affairs (Mutiarin & Sakir, 2015; Suryanto & Ahmad Djunaedi, 2015). With the existence of the Act, it is hoped that the DIY Government can provide the rights of its people to live in prosperity. However, these expectations still cannot be fulfilled properly (Mutiarin & Sakir, 2015). As reinforced by an article written by Iqbal (2020) that in spatial management it is stated in Local Regulation (Peraturan Daerah, Perda) No. 2 of 2010 which was later enacted and enacted the Law, is expected to provide welfare for the rights of the community and the fact is that it is still not going well. Various factors that make this happen include the existence of urban development that does not comply with applicable laws, including the irregular construction of malls and hotels. Like Sleman City Hall, the construction was carried out before the regulation took effect (Iqbal et al., 2020). Thontowi (2019) also added that although the existence of privileges law number 13/2012 received a positive response from the DIY community, and it has also been implemented in a number of special Jogjakarta Regional Regulations (Peraturan Daerah Istimewa, Perda) such as the appointment of positions, Institutional Perda and Cultural Perda, but at the implementation level have not been able to improve the welfare of the people of DIY due to the use of the power factor among the DPRD DIY considering that there has been a conflict of interest between members of the Keraton family (Thontowi, 2019).

The issuance of the privileges law number 13/2012 is an affirmation of the special status of DIY. To carry out these privileges, the DIY Regional Government received a Privileges Fund budget from IDR 231 billion in 2013 to IDR 800 billion in 2017. The Privileges Fund budgeting process uses a mixed approach between traditional budgeting and performance-based budgeting, with top-down and bottom-up methods up. There is an inconsistency between the programs and activities planned and those implemented by the Regional Government of DIY, due to external and internal factors, so that it can have an impact on the success of the goals, objectives and vision and mission to be achieved. Community Participation in Cultural
Development and Preservation, as well as target indicators of the Suitability of Spatial Utilization to the Provincial Spatial Plans (Rencana Tata Ruang /Wilayah, RTRW). Nine of the 17 main performance indicators of the 2012-2017 Regional Medium Term Development Plan (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah, RPJMD) that received additional budget allocation contributions from the Privileges Fund, managed to achieve the target. Meanwhile, the additional allocation of Privileges Fund for performance target indicators of the suitability of space utilization to the Provincial RTRW, has not yet succeeded in achieving the target. The four main performance indicators of the 2012-2017 RPJMD, which failed to reach the target, did not receive additional budget allocation contributions from the Privileges Fund. One of the reasons why the Privileges Fund is not allocated for performance indicators that do not reach the target is, among others, due to the limitations of the laws and regulations. The inefficacy of the performance target indicators for the suitability of space utilization against the Provincial RTRW is partly due to the fact that most of the activities carried out are only in the form of planning with output in the form of documents, and land acquisition, while physical development is only carried out for activities in a limited area. The obstacles faced by the DIY Government in the Privilege Fund budgeting process are: (1) The high element of uncertainty in the Privilege Fund budget allocation from the Central Government, (2) the DIY Regional Government does not yet have indicators to measure program/activity outcomes, (3) There is no unequal understanding of each Regional Apparatus Work Unit (Satuan Kerja Perangkat Daerah, SKPD) on Privileges Funds, (4) Privileges Funds cannot be used to finance programs and activities other than privileges (Nazam & Hadna, 2018).

Privileges funds are funds originating from the budget section of the State General Treasurer which are allocated to fund special authorities and are transfer expenditures for other transfer sections. The institutions that have the right to supervise the management of the Privileges Fund are: the Inspectorate, Development Planning Agency at Sub-National Level (Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah, BAPPEDA) and Regional People’s Representative Assembly (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah, DPRD), all of which have different monitoring systems. The accountability of the Privileges Fund is carried out in 2 stages, namely: The first stage, the stage of making the Final Report on the Performance of the Privileges Fund and the Distribution of the Privileges Fund which is prepared by the Head of each Regional Government Work Unit who has used the Privilege Fund to the Governor or an authorized official. In the second stage, the Governor or authorized official submits the final stage of Privilege Funds Absorption Realization Report in the annual Accountability Performance Report or End of Office Accountability Performance Report to the DIY Regional House of Representatives (Ali, 2020).

Based on the background of the problem above, a question arises, “Why does the Sultanate of Yogyakarta which was established in 1755 still exist as a political administrative reality in the national political system of the Republic of Indonesia?”
II. Method

This study uses qualitative methods using primary and secondary data. On the one hand, primary data were collected through observation or field studies and conducted observations in Yogyakarta, Indonesia from 2012 to 2022. In addition, interviews with several related sources. As for secondary data, it is done by collecting references through literature studies, previous literature, official data and documents from the Indonesian central government as well as documents from the official website of the Yogyakarta government. References collected in the form of print media and electronic media. After all the data is collected, then the data is processed and put together in this article.

III. Findings

a. Socio-historical of Speciality of Yogyakarta

The Special Region of Yogyakarta is a provincial-level autonomous region of Indonesia in southern Java (PemerintahDIY, 2016). It has also been known as the Special Territory of Yogyakarta (Yogyakarta, 1974, 1982).
Co-ruled by the Yogyakarta Sultanate and the Duchy of Pakualaman, the region is the only officially recognized diarchy within the government of Indonesia. The Yogyakarta Sultanate was established in 1755 and provided unwavering support for Indonesia’s independence during the Indonesian National Revolution (1945–1949). As a first-level division in Indonesia, Yogyakarta is governed by Sultan Hamengkubuwono X as the governor and Prince Paku Alam as the vice governor. In Javanese, it is Yogyakarta, and named after the city of Ayodhya in Javanese-Hindu mythology (Hannigan, 2012). The Dutch name of the Special Region is Djokjakarta.

The Sultanate has existed in various forms through prehistory and survived through the rule of the Dutch and the 1942 invasion of the Dutch East Indies by the Japanese Empire. In August 1945 Indonesia's first president, Sukarno proclaimed the independence of the Indonesian Republic, and by September of that year, Sultan Hamengkubuwono IX and Duke Sri Paku Alam VIII had sent letters to Sukarno expressing their support for the newly born nation of Indonesia, in which they acknowledged the Yogyakarta Sultanate as part of the Indonesian Republic.

Yogyakarta’s overwhelming support and the Sultan’s patriotism were essential in the Indonesian struggle for independence during the Indonesian National Revolution (1945–1949). The city of Yogyakarta became the capital of the Indonesian Republic from January 1946 to December 1948 after the fall of Jakarta to the Dutch. Later, the Dutch also invaded Yogyakarta causing the Indonesian Republic’s capital to be transferred again to Bukittinggi in West Sumatra on 19 December 1948. In return for Yogyakarta’s support, the declaration of Special Authority over Yogyakarta was granted in full in 1950 and Yogyakarta was given the status as a Special Administrative Region, making Yogyakarta the only region headed by a monarchy in Indonesia.

Pict. 6. Sultan Hamengkubuwono X as the Governor and Pakualaman IX as the Deputy Governor with Jokowi (Inaguration)
Source: Sorot Jogja (2022)

b. The privileged position of Yogyakarta is very clear constitutionally

The privileged position of Yogyakarta is in accordance with the precepts of Pancasila, especially the third principle which reads, “Indonesian Unity”. This can be interpreted that, although Yogyakarta has its own specialties by being designated as a special area, Yogyakarta is still part of the Republic of Indonesia. Indonesia has always embraced Yogyakarta as part of the Republic of Indonesia, even with the special status it bears. Thus, both the people of Yogyakarta and the people of Indonesia still have a high sense of unity because they both have a high national spirit as the people of Indonesia.

The privileged position of Yogyakarta can also be seen in Article 18 of the 1945 Constitution, especially in Article 18A and Article 18B, which reads:

Article 18A
(1) The relationship of authority between the central government and provincial, regency, and city regional governments, or between provinces and regencies and cities, is regulated by law with due observance of the specificity and diversity of regions.

(2) Financial relations, public services, utilization of natural resources and other resources between the central government and regional governments are regulated and implemented fairly and in harmony based on the law.

Article 18B
(1) The state recognizes and respects special or special regional government units which are regulated by law.

(2) The state recognizes and respects customary law community units and their traditional rights as long as they are still alive and in accordance with the development of society and the principles of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, which are regulated by law (DPRRI, 2016).

Yogyakarta which has a position as a Special Region is also regulated by privileges law number 13/2012 especially Article 1 paragraphs 1 to 3, which contains:

Article 1
(1) The Special Region of Yogyakarta, hereinafter referred to as DIY, is a provincial area that has privileges in administering government affairs within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia.

(2) Privileges are the privileges of legal standing owned by DIY based on history and original rights according to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia to regulate and administer special powers.

(3) Special Authority is certain additional authority owned by DIY other than the authority as specified in the law on regional government (UUD1945, 2012).

C. Contents of the Special Law of Yogyakarta and its Practice for 10 years (2012-2022)

In the political field, filling the positions of governor and deputy governor so as not to collide with the National Law. Privileges in the field of procedures for filling the positions, positions, duties, and authorities of the Governor and Deputy Governor, among others, special requirements for the candidate for governor of DIY are Sultan Hamengkubuwana who is on the throne, and the deputy governor is Adipati Paku Alam who is on the throne. The Governor and the Deputy Governor have the same positions, duties, and authorities as other Governors and Deputy Governors, plus the administration of privileged affairs (UUD1945, 2012). The specialty in the institutional field of the DIY Regional Government is the arrangement and establishment of institutions, with the Perdais, to achieve effectiveness and efficiency in the administration of government and public services based on the principles of responsibility, accountability, transparency, and participation by taking into account the original form and structure of government (UUD1945, 2012).

According to Act No. 22 of 1948 (which is also the basis of Act No. 3 of 1950 on the formation of DIY), the Head and Vice Head of the Special Region are appointed by the President from the descendants of the ruling family in the region prior to Indonesian independence with the conditions of “skill, honesty, and loyalty, and keeping in mind the customs of the area.” Thus, the Head of the Special Region, until 1988, was automatically held by the reigning Sultan of Yogyakarta, and the Vice Head of the Special Region, until 1998,
was automatically held by Prince Paku Alam who was on the throne. The nomenclature of the Governor and Vice Governor of the Special Region has only been used since 1999 with the issuance of Act No. 22 of 1999. Since 2012, the mechanism for filling the positions of Governor and Vice Governor of DIY is regulated by privileges law number 13/2012 on the Uniqueness of the Special Region of Yogyakarta (UUD1945, 2012).

In order not to collide with the National Law, then:

a. Filling every 5 years as in other provinces, but those who can register are Sultan or PA holders. The difference is, Yogya was only registered for the Stakeholders of the Sultan and PA at that time; different from the national rules that every citizen has the same rights. Sultan and PA are entitled to hold office for life, in contrast to the national system which allows a person to serve as governor/wagub for a maximum of 5 years multiplied by 2 periods.

b. In the Yogyakarta Sultanate, as part of Islamic Mataram (along with PA, Pakubuwono and Mangkunegoro Surakarta) there is a convention that the King must be male. The rules for filling in the candidates for the Governor of Yogyakarta Deputy Governor must not conflict with national regulations and human rights that every citizen regardless of gender background has the right to become Governor / Deputy Governor. An article appears, the requirement for a candidate for governor to have a wife/husband (can be filled in by a man or a woman)

d. Specialties in Culture

The specialty in the field of culture is to maintain and develop the results of creativity, taste, initiative, and work in the form of values, knowledge, norms, customs, objects, arts, and noble traditions rooted in the DIY community, which are regulated by local regulations (UUD1945, 2012). Special funds, how much per year is RP / US Dollar; allotment.

e. Land and Spatial Planning

The privilege in the land sector is that the Sultanate and the Duchy are authorized to manage and utilize the land of the Sultanate and the land of the Duchy aimed at the maximum development of culture, social interests, and the welfare of the community. The specialty in the field of spatial planning is the authority of the Sultanate and the Duchy in spatial planning on the management and utilization of the Sultanate land and the Duchy land (UUD1945, 2012). For example, the all coastal area 2 km from the coastline along the 90 km in all Jogja Coastal is the status of Sultan Ground (SG) or Paku Alaman Ground (PAG).

IV. Discussion

There are three ideal types that distinguish between “ruling monarchy”, “constitutional monarchy” and what they call “democratic parliamentary monarchy”. The defining characteristic of a democratic parliamentary monarchy is that only a freely elected parliament forms and ends the government. In contrast, in a constitutional monarchy, there is a strong element of dual legitimacy in the parliament and monarchies need each other's support to form or end a government. An even greater contrast, in a reigning monarchy, the monarchy can often unilaterally form or end government (Stepan et al., 2014).
Before discussing Yogyakarta, we will first discuss several countries in the world that still adhere to the monarchical leadership system to this day. The monarchical system of leadership is the oldest political system of government in the world based on a one-man government in which the supreme authority is held by the king, an individual ruler who serves as head of state and who attains his position through heredity. Most monarchies only allow male succession, such as from father to son. The monarchy system of government is divided into 3 types, namely Absolute Monarchy, Constitutional Monarchy, and Parliamentary Monarchy. Some countries that adhere to the monarchical leadership system to date are:

- The United Kingdom is one of the countries that still adheres to a constitutional monarchy system to this day. Before Queen Elizabeth II died, the British monarchy was still under her rule since 1952 where she became the longest-serving ruler in British royal history. The United Kingdom has four ruling states namely Scotland, England, Wales and Northern Ireland.

- The Kingdom of Saudi Arabia today is still led by King Salman bin Abdul Aziz al-Saud by adopting an absolute monarchy leadership system, where the existence of the prime minister in Saudi Arabia is only for a symbolic form, because the full power belongs to the king.

- The Kingdom of Qatar is an Emirati state in the Middle East that has a leader from the Thani family since the 19th century. Qatar was also founded by Sheikh Jassim bin Mohammed al Thani. Qatar is currently ruled by King Sheikh Tamim bin Hamad al Thani. The Kingdom of Qatar adheres to a constitutional monarchy leadership system, just like the British monarchy.

- The Kingdom of the Netherlands adheres to a constitutional monarchy parliamentary democratic government system and still has some federal elements in it. Because the Netherlands has a constitutional system, the prime minister has an important role in it. Now the Netherlands is still led by King William Alexander who replaced his mother Queen Beatrix since 2013. The Netherlands is called a country that has a bicameral parliament because the king indirectly governs the country, but the king still has the power as a president of the state council.

- The Kingdom of Kuwait implements a semi-constitutional monarchy government system with its leader named Nawaf al Sabah who has led since 29 September 2020. Previously the King of Kuwait was King Sabah al Ahmad al Jaber al Sabah who died at the age of 91 years.

Collaboration between democracy and monarchy occurs in government systems in several countries. What happened in Yogyakarta was a monarchy system originating from the Islamic Mataram kingdom, which was later recognized as a political institution holding executive power in the democratic system of the Indonesian state. The King of Yogyakarta acts as the executive power holder (Governor) in the Special Region of Yogyakarta. Yogyakarta was an Islamic kingdom which later joined the Indonesia state as a province with a special status. As King, the Sultan is always supervised by the regional people’s representative council in the administration of regional government (Nugroho et al., 2021).
The relationship between Yogyakarta and the central government of Jakarta is harmonious because Yogyakarta has 6 elements of rationality, namely rational choice (survival, security, economy/welfare, prestige, and influence). This success can be a role model for other regions in Indonesia and other countries in the world.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NO</th>
<th>ASPECT</th>
<th>YOGYAKARTA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Survival</td>
<td>privileges law number 13/2012, the third sila of Pancasila, Article 18 of the constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Security</td>
<td>privileges law number 13/2012, the third sila of Pancasila, Article 18 of the constitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Economy/welfare</td>
<td>Law of Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Prestige</td>
<td>Cultural Privileges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Influence</td>
<td>The position of Governor / Deputy governor automatically for life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab. 1. Yogyakarta

Source: Authors

Yogyakarta’s Asymmetric Decentralization is one of the most unique because it is the only one in the world a semi-monarchical local government under the unitary republican national government. Which is somewhat similar is Monaco under the national system of the French Republic, but theoretically Monaco is an independent country (quasi-state), but its foreign policy takes refuge in France.

V. Conclusion

The relationship between Yogyakarta local political actors and the central government in Jakarta is harmonious because Yogyakarta has 6 elements of rationality, namely rational choice (survival, security, economy/welfare, prestige, and influence). This success can be a role model for other regions in Indonesia and other countries in the world in establishing harmonious relations with the central government. Asymmetric Decentralization Yogyakarta is one of the most unique because it is the only one in the world a semi-monarchical local government under the unitary national government of the republic.

Pict. 7. Sultan Hamengkubuwono X and his family
Source: Kompasiana (2012)

Pict. 8. Pakualaman IX and his family
Source: Gudeg (2016)
Works Cited


